

# Dalits, MNREGA and Development: A Theoretical Analysis of the impact of MNREGA on Dalits

Kunal Kumar Yadav

PhD, Centre for Political Studies, SSS, JNU, New Delhi

---

**Abstract:** *This paper deals with the interrelation of MNREGA, Capability Approach and Dalits. MNREGA has been designed to promote inclusive growth and bring the marginalised sections of the society, like Dalits in the mainstream process of development. MNREGA promotes the capability formation of the vulnerable sections of the society and the very purpose of the scheme was to bring the poor at the centre of the development process through participatory mechanisms. MNREGA promotes the well-being as well as agency freedom of the disadvantaged sections of the society and this section will examine the impact of this scheme on Dalits who are specifically disadvantaged due to their traditional low status and excluded position in the Indian society.*

MNREGA has emerged as a major source for securing livelihood through guaranteed wages for the Dalit communities and the maximum participation by the Dalit communities in this scheme is a major proof of this fact that MNREGA is actually enhancing the capability of the Dalits. But before proceeding further it is necessary to understand the status of the Dalits in the Indian society and the various kinds of disadvantages which are associated with the Dalit communities.

India is the most stratified society in the world. There are huge income disparities, caste, religious and community differences that are engraved into everyday social relations. Hindus believe that there are specific coded substances in them that set them apart from one another on the basis of castes. These substances are incommensurable and cannot be compromised; hence the rules of purity and pollution are to be strictly followed on the basis of their respective castes (Gupta, 2005, p.411). "Social relations are finely calibrated to make sure that people did not compromise their inherent and inalienable substances by being in close proximity with members of different castes (Gupta, 2005, p.412)." The relationship between castes was played out within the confines of the closed natural economy of the village community leaving no room for the maneuver for the subaltern communities and castes. The caste system "produced a notion of subjected

personhood in which there is an erosion of agency and the sense of self worth of individuals or groups is not individually defined but is marked by the violence of persistent and pervasive humiliation, deprivation and indignities (Vasavi, 2006)." Caste creates a network in which a person cannot be or become a person in his or her own capacities. Caste is a subtle, persistent and systematic form of indignities that corrodes a person's sense of self worth and leads to the existence of subjected personhood. The dominance of caste system has led to the low, segregated position of low ranked caste members and it has caused the internalization of low status by the low caste people and accordingly articulate and interact with others in terms of submission and subordination within a hierarchical system (Vasavi, 2006, p 3767). Caste not only subordinates the political, it also reduces individuals to relative importance. Dumont holds that the political and the economic domain of the social life in India are encompassed by the religious domain, which is articulated in terms of opposition between purity and pollution. The traditional society was organized by social and religious rather than political principles and caste has resisted the development of modern state and social structures (Dirks, 1992, p.58). Caste neither permitted the development of voluntarist or politically malleable social institutions, nor did it work to reinforce the modern state.

Societies based on slavery, hierarchical status, untouchability and caste system are all examples of institutionalised humiliation. Legal institutions deny them the basic rights, social institutions work in harmony to produce graded inequality in the society, political institutions deny them a voice in the conduct of the affairs and indeed, every area of life proclaims their inferiority and marginality. Societies based on institutionalised humiliation generally rely on interrelated measures for their survival. These societies create a kind of common sense for legitimising the oppressive structure so that its members instinctively understand their social world in terms of its categories and cannot even imagine that the society could be structured in a different way (Parekh, 2009, p.33). Those living in degrading economic, social and political condition do not get the opportunity to develop their capacity

and due to this they are seen as 'legitimate' object of humiliation. Degrading system of life crushes the spirit of the oppressed class and they find it difficult to organize and challenge the prevailing social structure. This oppressive and degrading structure is maintained by the individual members of the dominant groups and the structure authorizes them to administer chastisement, dismiss from jobs, ostracize, insult, and use such measures to keep the structure of oppression and humiliation intact (Parekh, 2009, p.32).

The scheduled castes are the 'untouchables'. Traditional Hindu religious values emphasized on physically 'contagious' ritual pollution, which was supposed to be hereditary trait of all members of a given caste. Scheduled castes were at the bottom of the local economic scale and the ritual degradation and material deprivation and dependence reinforced one another. It is this combination of religiously based social discrimination and isolation with economic disadvantages which has given the institution of untouchability its sting and stability (Joshi, 1980, p.195). It doesn't provide for the social mobility of any caste. Under the condition of severely depressed social status, it was extremely difficult for an untouchable caste to alter its position in society. The category of Scheduled Caste is composed of many separate castes which share certain common handicaps in relation to the rest of the society. For centuries, 'untouchable' has been a generalized status category and the castes superior in hierarchy have benefitted from the cheap labor, cheap relative prestige and the limitation on both social and economic competition that this caste system has created.

Dalits, literally meaning "broken people" or "oppressed" in Hindi, are the lowest members of the Hindu caste system in India. The caste system is a Hindu hierarchical class structure with roots in India dating back thousands of years. The notion of untouchability emerged out of the caste system and it created a life of degradation for the Dalit communities. Dalits had to do those works which the traditional Indian society found ritually polluting such as handling carcasses, disposing of human waste (also known as the practice of manual scavenging), sweeping streets, or cobbling (considered degrading because of its association with feet and leather). Dalits have faced enormous ill treatment from the upper castes and the list of the atrocities is endless. If Dalits attempted to defy the caste system and express their freedom, they received cruel punishment such as being forced to parade naked through the streets and being beaten, raped, tortured and hanged.

Although Article 17 of the Indian Constitution banned untouchability in 1950, Dalits still suffer widespread discrimination and

mistreatment, particularly in villages and rural communities. The local law enforcement personnel often refuse to document, investigate and respond adequately to the conditions of the Dalit communities and their complaints. The strong hierarchical system and the strong upper caste network often threaten and assault the Dalits who dare to come forward and express their democratic rights. Examples of ongoing discrimination against Dalits include the continued practices of traditional segregation between upper castes and Dalits. In places throughout India, Dalits must bring their own utensils to eat or drink in public places so as not to pollute the utensils of high caste members. In many areas, Dalits may not drink from the same wells as upper caste members do, and may not enter temples where high caste Hindus worship.

Despite the government's efforts and legal provisions, Dalit communities are still doing their demeaning traditional jobs and the upper caste nexus is forcing them to stay poor, oppressed and marginalized. When Dalits refuse to comply with such upper caste demands, they face violence or social boycotts that involve practices such as refusing to sell groceries to Dalits or to hire Dalit workers. Dalit children are subjected to human rights abuses as well. These children are common victims of bonded labor practices, even though bonded labor is outlawed in India. Dalit families become indebted to moneylenders to pay for emergency health services or daily sustenance needs, Dalit children are often forced to work off these debts. Due to the purposefully low wages these children are paid, they can rarely ever earn enough money to pay back their debts and break free from their labor obligations.

Untouchability is both a condition of existence, as well as violent expression of power. It is a state of continuous oppression and humiliation and the unjust nature of the caste system could be understood "in terms of the imperatives of production and reproduction, discipline and punishment, sexual control and regulation" (Geetha, 2009. P.96). The practices of untouchability includes "segregation of living spaces, the taboos against sharing water points, burial grounds, temples, the ban on adornment, the consigning of an entire group of people to deadening labour, the haunting of their existence by the fear of punishment, should they fudge norms and cross limits" (Geetha, 2009. p.96). The punishments given to Dalits are soul-wounding and gratuitous like; the forcible eating of excreta, punishment by fire branding, the rape and mutilation of bodies. According to V. Geetha, "Whatever its structural correlates, untouchability is essentially an experience of wounding, of willful hurt, through the body of the outcaste becomes a stranger to itself, and is ever ready to fall off the

edge, give into anomie and fragmentation” (Geetha, 2009. P.97).

Untouchability is an extreme form of alienation in which the laborer, Dalit, is alienated not only from the fruits of his labor but also from his own laboring body. They are forced to do the demeaning works due to their ‘low-born’ status and their ‘impure’ body is considered fit for such works and are held to be suited to this and not other vocations. The untouchable body thus becomes a distinctive laboring body whose work has neither material nor symbolic value (Geetha, 2009. p.97). These Dalits form a large chunk of the rural population and they act as a major rural workforce who are basically landless or near landless laborers. There is a political economy of untouchability and the Dalits form a pool of free labor for the land owning upper caste and class in India.

The chief reason of untouchability and the vulnerability of the Dalits lie in their poor material conditions and lack of capability to exercise their well being and agency freedom. Most of the Dalits in India reside in the rural areas where they have no or nearly no access to basic entitlements and amenities like food, shelter, clothing, safe drinking water, education and other such facilities. The live in the condition of extreme poverty and exist as landless and near landless laborers in the society and remain dependent on the land owning rich and powerful upper castes for their basic needs in return of their free and cheap labor. The asymmetry of wealth, market power and organization between the upper caste employers and the Dalit laborers is reinforced by the laborers’ option being severely constrained by the lack of access to the means of production, education, skills and job opportunities (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-23). The power and control that the landed upper caste exercises in the labor transactions through a combination of extra economic transactions and market power, leaves no bargaining power in the hands of the poor Dalit laborers (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-21). Moreover, due to their organizational weakness, the landless poor remains at the mercy of the powerful landed class for its survival.

The landless Harijans and Adivasis remain concentrated in the lowest paid rank of farm labor and a variety of coolie labor. The access to better jobs and self employment remains stratified, even as the non-farm jobs multiply in urban-industrial and rural areas (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-23). The institutional and the political process reinforce the asset inequalities in favor of the landed upper caste and class and there is a deep connection between the structural inequalities and market failures and powers which is responsible for the rural poverty and exploitation of the Dalit communities. When “the labor market remains segmented, the access to marketable skills and

employment opportunities stratified and the institutions of socio-cultural hierarchy interacts with the instruments of economic power and control” (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-23), it cannot be expected that the Dalit communities will be able to negotiate their bargaining power with the rich, dominant and powerful upper castes. These Dalit communities are basically small farmers and landless poor and their development is hampered by, “credit market failure with collateral and information problem, credit tying or debt bondage, market-interlocking transactions, social barriers in the access to new opportunities” (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-22). These factors combine to produce chronic deviation from income distribution and push them to the periphery of the social, political and economic structures of the society. The demographic pressure on land, the decreasing land-people ratio has weakened the sufficiency for the case for land redistribution to end rural poverty. It is here that the need for a public employment programme becomes crucial for eradicating the rural poverty and addressing the concerns of the rural landless and Dalit laborers.

The laborers’ lack of options, the severe economic distress under which they operate in market conditions, their bargaining disadvantage due to their weak organizational capacity can be reduced significantly by generating counter seasonal employment opportunities, collective organization and mutual support network of rural laboring class, mostly Dalits (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-32). The laborers suffer most during the lean seasons and “improving the lean-season employment opportunities for the landless and near landless can at least let them afford a higher reservation price in negotiating risk-sharing transactions and contractual tie-ins, instead of having to be so utterly dependent on employer-credit to get through the slack season and constantly making distress sales of future labor” (Bardhan, 1989, p.A-28). It is here that the importance of MNREGA becomes crucial for eradicating the rural poverty and addressing the concerns of the marginalized communities, like Dalits.

Due to its inclusive approach and participatory mechanism, MNREGA has emerged as the most favored public employment programme by the Dalit communities. MNREGA offers guaranteed income to the Dalit communities which help them to overcome their extreme poverty and vulnerability. The income secured through MNREGA helps the poor Dalits to afford basic entitlements like food and clothing which helps them to escape starvation. The dependence of the Dalits for their day to day survival on the upper castes decreases as MNREGA has emerged as a viable option for a decent earning for the Dalit

communities. Since, MNREGA ensures a guaranteed wage and legal entitlement of the right to work; it has helped the Dalit communities to overcome their vulnerability.

Traditionally, Dalits have been treated as untouchables by the broader spectrum of the society and they have been denied participation in the public domain. Their exploitation in the form of cheap or free labour has been their primary use and their lives do not have any meaning of their own in the traditional caste system. Their existence means only one thing in the traditional caste system and that is providing unconditional service to the upper castes in the form of free labor. The same system of bonded labor and caste hierarchy existed more or less in the rural area for a long time in the history of independent India and the landless Dalit laborers had to depend on their masters for their occasional charity which formed the basis of their survival. MNREGA has changed this scenario dramatically in the rural areas. Dalit laborers are becoming increasingly aware of right to work and 100 days employment becoming a legal entitlement has significantly boosted the bargaining power of the Dalit laborers in the rural labor structure. They are no longer dependent solely on the exploitative employment provided by the rich, powerful landed upper castes and MNREGA has emerged as a reliable alternative for the Dalit laborers.

MNREGA has made the Dalit wage seekers more aware of their rights as it ensures that there cannot be any discrimination in providing work to anybody who demands it, upon the basis of caste, religion or other such social factors. It has produced a kind of consciousness among the Dalit laborers that dignified existence is their right as MNREGA provides for a dignified environment to work. There cannot be any kind of caste based discrimination at the worksite and each and every laborer, irrespective of his social background is entitled to a guaranteed wage upon the completion of the work. The democratic and participatory provisions of MNREGA has made the Dalit workers aware of this fact that their labour cannot be used free of cost by the powerful land-owning class and that there is value of their labour which is their democratic right. This awareness in gradually transforming the labour structure of the rural society and the Dalit laborers are becoming assertive in exercising their legal and democratic rights. Moreover, working in an exploitation free environment under MNREGA has led to the development of a kind of unified consciousness among the Dalit workers that dignified labor is their democratic right and exploitative employment is against the democratic spirit of liberty and equality.

MNREGA has led to the development of a kind of organizational structure among the Dalit workers and this has given them sufficient bargaining power in the rural labor market. The caste structure works in such a way that it prohibits the growth of any kind of unified consciousness among the exploited Dalit communities and this lack of any kind of unified consciousness keeps the exploited class from challenging the exploitative and oppressive structures of caste hierarchy. The continuous degradation and exploitation of the Dalit communities keeps them in the state of extreme poverty and prevents them from developing any capacity upon the basis of which they could challenge the oppressive and humiliating social structure. MNREGA has helped the Dalit communities to come and work together in a discrimination and exploitation free environment and this has led to the development of kind of unified consciousness among the Dalit workers, which is helping them to challenge the exploitative social practices based on caste based discrimination.

MNREGA as a scheme is helping the Dalit labourers to ensure their substantive as well as instrumental freedom. It is helping the Dalit communities to move away from their traditional jobs like manual scavenging, handling carcasses, sweeping streets, or cobbling which are considered to be 'polluting' by larger section of the traditional rural society. These demeaning and insulting jobs were the chief reason of their stigmatization in traditional Hindu society which prevented their social mobility and social interaction. Guaranteed employment and respectable fair work options, provided by MNREGA to the Dalit communities has helped them to switch over from their traditional demeaning jobs to a more respectable and dignified employment. This has helped the Dalit communities to overcome their social stigmatization and it has significantly increased their social mobility and social interaction.

The increased social mobility, social interaction and organizational power of the laborers are some of the important benefits of the MNREGA and these are helping the Dalit communities to challenge the structures of institutionalized humiliation in the society. The very nature of the caste system creates a kind of social matrix in which a person cannot become a person in his or her own capacity. It creates a kind of institutionalized form of exclusion and oppression in which the oppressed castes are excluded from the social, political, economic and cultural practices. MNREGA has provided the Dalit communities the opportunity to break this matrix of exploitation and become an agent of change and development in their own capacity. MNREGA actively engages the wage earners in the

economic and political activities at the grass-root level through Panchayati Raj institutions which has its social implications. It challenges the notion of subjected personhood produced by the caste system which erodes the self respect of the Dalit communities and severely curtails their agency role in the society. The increased participation of the Dalit communities in the planning and implementation of MNREGA gives them an agency role in the society, which plays an important role in building their self-esteem and self-confidence and liberates them from the state of subjected personhood. Their improved participation helps them to challenge the notion of 'common sense' prevailing in the society which legitimizes their victimisation and oppression. MNREGA is thus acting as an important factor in bringing the social change in the rural society and it is helping the poor and the vulnerable sections to actively bring change in their own position and become agents of development.

As it has been discussed earlier in this chapter, MNREGA can be intrinsically and comprehensively described through Capability Approach and as a scheme it helps in increasing the overall freedom of the beneficiaries of this programme. MNREGA has a direct impact on the capability formation of the most vulnerable sections of the society, like Dalits. It substantially increases their well-being and agency freedom and this helps the Dalit communities to secure substantial as well as instrumental freedoms. MNREGA has prevented a substantial number of people from acute starvation which is evident from the fact that this number has come down after the implementation of MNREGA in various parts of the country, especially, the backward ones.

The capability approach to development takes into account the individualistic approach to a person, but many capabilities are culturally specific. People's activities take place in the social structure as well as their abilities and endowments. With capabilities inseparable from social structure, the capability approach needs to address the agency-structure question (Jackson, 2005, p.102). The caste system and the practice of untouchability form a hierarchical system of social structure in which the agency freedom of the individuals is severely curtailed. The individuals cannot choose their way of living under the caste system and people have to perform the specific function in the society however demeaning it may be. Social circumstances affect the individuals and in order to have a comprehensive scope for the capabilities of the individuals, it is necessary to examine the social and structural conditions and address the question of agency freedom of the individuals. Untouchables are excluded from the social activities and denied participation in the society. MNREGA engages the

untouchables and Dalit communities in the development process and tries to bring out their agency role and to use it for the effective implementation of the programme as well as to enhance their capabilities. The duality of the agency and the structure never merges. Rather, it could be inferred that structure moulds agency and agency reproduces structure (Jackson, 2005, p.110). Taking this fact into account, it can be said that MNREGA through the positive transformation of the agency role of the Dalit individuals is transforming the social structure based on hierarchical caste system towards a more egalitarian social structure. By elaborating the agency freedom of the individuals through its participatory mechanisms, it is making the society more democratic and more responsive to the need of the most vulnerable sections of the society. Capabilities could be seen as a blend of structural, social and individual capacities to act and MNREGA is acting at all these three levels to ensure that the well-being and the agency freedom of the poor is realised properly and the process of development remains more comprehensive in its outlook.

The 'well-being' of a person could be seen as the quality of the person's life. The quality of any persons' 'well-being' is directly related to the 'functioning' that the person commands. A person's achievement depends heavily upon the 'functioning vectors' that the individuals can command (Sen, 1999, pp.12-21). The relevant 'functionings' can vary from such elementary things as being adequately nourished, being in good health, premature mortality etc, to complex functionings such as being happy, having self respect, and taking part in the community life and so on (Sen, 2000, pp.74-75). The assessment of the persons 'well-being' depends upon the command of the person over these 'functionings'. MNREGA is helping the poor Dalit laborers to increase their command over these vital functionings by making it sure that a continuous flow of income comes to the Dalit laborers in the times when no other viable employment option remains available to them. These all vital functionings related to the well-being of the Dalits are income dependent and their absence could be life threatening. Guaranteed income through MNREGA ensures the elementary functionings like access to food, and prevents the poor Dalits from starvation and premature mortality due to undernourishment as well as complex functionings like self respect and increased participation in community life. Guaranteed income allows the poor Dalits to draw utilities out of the community resource pool and market and this enhances their self-respect and ensures a better community life and social

participation for them, which otherwise remains seriously hampered.

Caste structure of the society deliberately keeps the poor under the condition of extreme capability deprivation by denying them the substantive as well as instrumental freedoms. Capability deprivation weakens the individuality by reducing the 'freedom' of the individual through a reduction in the 'functioning choices' and 'capabilities' of the individual. The oppressive caste hierarchy severely affects the well-being of the untouchable castes and their capacity to function freely in the society. The 'well-being' of the individual has great importance for the analysis of the 'social inequality' and assessment of public policy. Problems of social injustice and the assessment of the 'inequality' between different groups relates strongly to the extensive disparities in the 'well-being' of the individuals (Sen, 1991, p.4).. Society may provide the relevant personal features like 'liberties', and 'primary goods', but the conversion of these functionings depends upon the agency freedom of the individuals and his potential to convert them into 'capabilities' (Sen, 2001, pp-39-42). Caste system plays havoc with the agency role of the individuals and due this, despite the promises of the constitutional guarantees it becomes almost impossible for the untouchable castes to convert those constitutional guarantees into actual capabilities. MNREGA is a very positive step which ensures that the democratic rights conferred by the constitution of India to the most disadvantaged sections of the society actually get substantiated at the grass root level.

MNREGA ensures the political freedom of the Dalit communities by providing them with the opportunity to participate in the local governance of the scheme. The democratic decentralization of power effectively challenges the oppressive caste structure and empowers the Dalits by providing them the opportunity to participate in the community affairs for effective and accountable implementation of MNREGA. It makes the political participation a legal entitlement and gives voice to the marginalized.

MNREGA ensures the instrumental freedom of economic facilities by providing the opportunity to utilize economic resources for the purpose of consumption, production and exchange. It empowers Dalits by making them an economic agent who are capable of drawing out the useful commodity and utilities out of society's pool of goods and services. The traditional caste structure prohibits the economic agency of the Dalit communities by alienating them from their fruits of their labor and turning them into slaves. The stigmatization of the untouchables in the traditional society prohibits them from adopting desired

occupation and keeps them in the state of perpetual indebtedness by deliberately keeping them poor and making them dependent on the mercy of the upper castes for their day to day requirements. Due to their extreme poverty and stigmatization they find themselves unable to draw goods and services from the pool of the society. MNREGA liberates them from this vicious cycle of poverty to a great extent by making them the agent of economic change through guaranteed wages. It ensures the availability and accessibility of finance to the Dalit laborers which can have a crucial impact on the economic entitlements of these communities.

MNREGA promotes the instrumental freedom of social opportunities for the Dalit communities due to its intrinsic characteristics. Dalits have been traditionally denied social opportunity by the dominant castes and their ghettoisation and spatial segregation had pushed to the periphery of the society. The stigma of being a Dalit leads to the closure of almost all the social opportunities under the traditional caste system and it gives the Dalits almost negligible maneuverability in the social space which severely curtails their social opportunity. MNREGA has brought them to the centre of social space by providing them to actively participate in the planning, execution and auditing of the scheme. It also promotes the instrumental freedom of protective security for the Dalit communities by acting as the safety net. Due to their extreme poverty, Dalits always remain under the risk of total collapse of all the entitlements and starvation. MNREGA has emerged as a reliable employment opportunity for the Dalits when they need it the most. It also facilitates the provision of transparency guarantees which makes the participation of the Dalits more meaningful in the day to day execution of the development process.

Moreover, MNREGA promotes the procedural as well as consequential freedom and this may have far reaching implications for the transformation of the caste based social structure towards more egalitarian society. Caste system is against the procedural freedom of the untouchables and it hampers the consequential freedom as well. MNREGA provides a comprehensive view of development and its participatory mechanism makes it ideal for the inclusion of the marginalised sections of the society in the mainstream process of development.

#### References

[13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19]Bardhan, Kalpana, Poverty, Growth and Rural labor Market in India, Economic and Political Weekly, Vol.24, No.12,( March 25, 1989), p. A-23

[5] Dirks, Nicholas B., Castes of Mind, *Representations*, No.37, *Special Issue: Imperial fantasies and Postcolonial Histories* (Winter, 1992), p. 58.

[9, 10, 11, 12] Geetha, V., 'Bereft of being', in *Humiliation: Claims and Contexts*, edited by Gopal Guru, (Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2009), p.96

[1, 2] Gupta, Dipankar, Caste and Politics: Identity over System, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol.34,(2005), p.411.

[8] Joshi, Barbara.R., "Ex-Untouchables": Problems, Progress and Policies in Indian Social Change, *Pacific Affairs*, Vol.53, No.2 ( Summer, 1980) ,p. 195

[6, 7] Parekh, Bhikhu, 'Logic of Humiliation', in *Humiliation: Claims and Contexts*, edited by Gopal Guru, (Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2009), p. 33

[22] Sen, Amartya, *Commodities and Capabilities*,(New Delhi: Oxford University Press,1999), pp.12-21.

[23] Sen, Amartya, *Development as Freedom*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2000),pp. 74-75.

[24] Sen, Amartya, "Capability and Well-Being," in M. Nussbaum and A. Sen, eds., *The Quality of Life* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991),p.4

[25] Sen, Amartya, *Inequality Reexamined* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press,2001), pp. 39-42.

[3, 4] Vasavi, A.R, Caste Indignities and Subjected Personhoods, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 41, No. 35 ( Sep. 2-8,2006)p.3766