Job Stress and Presenteeism among Nurses in Tertiary Level Hospitals in Pakistan

Lachman Das Malhi¹ Thitinut Akkadechanunt² & Somjai Sirakamon³

¹School of Nursing & Midwifery Mirpurkhas, Pakistan ²Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University Thailand & ³Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University Thailand

Abstract: Presenteeism among nurses is the decision to attend work while sick. It is a vital issue for nurse administrators and managers. The unusual circumstances of the health work atmosphere leads to the creation of job stress that further results in negative consequences- such as decreased productivity and poor quality care services to patients for organizations. This research explores the levels of job stress and presenteeism and the relationship between overall job stress and overall presenteeism perceived by nurses in tertiary level hospitals in Pakistan.

Introduction

In the 21st century, due to various factors, such as, technological advancement, socio-cultural development and globalization, health care institutions and hospitals are more difficult and challenging than they were in earlier decades [1]. The unusual circumstances of the healthcare work atmosphere greatly affect the behaviors involved in the decision-making process for job attendance [2]. Demands of attendance can take on diverse forms—presenteeism and absenteeism. Presenteeism is the worker experiences, due to some health problem, when a worker either decides to go to work while sick or to take sick leave [3]. Recent studies suggest that when employees show higher presenteeism at their work stations, it is an indication of better performance in that organization in comparison with absenteeism [4, 5].

Presenteeism is defined as an active employee engagement in work with a focus on cognitive, emotional, and behavioral engagement during work [6]. Moreover, presenteeism consists of two dimensions: (1) completing work, which refers to the amount of work accomplished despite some sort of presenteeism effect (work focus); and (2) avoiding distraction, which denotes the ability to concentrate in the process of doing work despite some sort of presenteeism effect (psychological focus).

A review of empirical literature shows that the costs of sickness-related absenteeism and sickness-related presenteeism have been assessed. Health-related work losses due to sickness absence were estimated to cost US employers more than 260 billion USD each year [7, 8]. Conversely, studies from the USA reported that sickness presenteeism has resulted in expenditures of over 150 billion USD per annum [9]. These studies and data clearly indicate that costs due to sickness absence are much higher compared to the presenteeism. Workforce output can be improved significantly not only through lower absenteeism, but also by increased presenteeism as reinforced by the outcomes of some studies [10, 11].

This paper explores the levels of job stress and presenteeism and the relationship between overall job stress and overall presenteeism. In recent years the interest in the presenteeism has been growing, among hospital settings, clinicians, and researchers. Numerous studies have revealed that nursing is strenuous work; hence, job stress is prevalent among nurses. While much research is available that has explored the rates of sickness, workload, and management, there is a paucity of reported academic research work in the area of job stress and presenteeism among tertiary care hospitals. The findings of the study may contribute to the body of knowledge and provide the better understanding the association between job stress and presenteeism. Furthermore, this study result may provide the evidence for nurse administrator to further develop strategies to reduce stress and encourage better performance of present nurse in organization.

2. Related Works

Empirical literature has shown that several factors have association with presenteeism, such as unhealthy lifestyles; illnesses; allergies and asthma; poor work-life [12]; burnout [13]; occupational stress; work impairment; perceived productivity [14, 15]; and job stress [16]. The significance of management of job stress (JS) is documented in literature that neglecting this problem...
may result in various negative consequences for organizations as well as workers including nurses, such as reduced productivity, loss of working hours, arousal of diseases, and occupational accidents [17]; absenteeism, turnover, and diminished job satisfaction [18]; and low morale and burnout [19].

Among the above factors, job stress was most prominent, justifying its selection by researchers. However, previous studies on the relationship between JS and presenteeism have yielded varied results. For example, in a recent study in the USA, [20] found that JS has a significantly direct positive relationship with presenteeism ($\beta = 0.30$, $p < 0.001$). Conversely, [1] found that presenteeism negatively correlated with JS among employees. Finally, in a joint study in Australia and the UK, [21] found JS was not significantly related to presenteeism among employees. The results of these studies show that observed relationships between presenteeism and JS were inconsistent. Therefore, in order to confirm the association between these two variables, more research studies are needed.

Job stress in general and stress in particular is the psychological and emotional state that is internally represented as part of a stressful transaction [22]. Using the theory of Lazarus & Folkman (1984) of psychological stress and coping by incorporating the stress process, [23] developed the Extended Nursing Stress Scale (ENSS) to measure job stress among nurses. Much nursing research has used ENSS to measure job stress at global level. For example, [24] found high job stress among nurses in two hospitals in Ghana. However, [25] found moderate job stress among nurses in an acute public care hospital in Hong Kong. In Serbia, [26] found that the 9 factors on the ENSS accounted for 52% of nursing job stress variance in Intensive Care Units among nurses. These studies clearly show that job stress is more prevalent among nurses’ in hospitals worldwide.

According to [27], World Bank statistics in 2009 show that Pakistan has 0.56 nursing and midwifery personnel and 0.5 physicians per 1,000 population. The existing nurse-patient ratio in the general wards in Pakistan is approximately 1:50, whereas the Pakistan Nursing Council (PNC) has recommended 1:10 and as per a government notification, Pakistan lacks 60,000 nurses [28]. Urban-based hospitals are facing an acute shortage of nurses [29]. One reason for this shortage is the environment in which nurses perform their duties [30]. Additionally, nurses are facing high workload, problems with supervisors, and non-conducive work environment [31, 32]. Literature confirms that some of such factors are likely to produce job stress among the nurses [33]. However, little is known about the extent of job stress, according to the dimensions suggested by [23] among nurses in tertiary level hospitals in Pakistan.

Furthermore, [34] have found the following proportion of nurses in Pakistan with various health conditions: hypertension, 18.8%; coronary artery disease, 33.3%; diabetes, 10.9%. This study and data show that nurses in Pakistan have moderate to high sickness rates. However, little is known whether the occurrences of sickness affect their work performance. Nurses’ work is in demanding shifts and they are also exposed to life-threatening infections; however, they still diligently perform their jobs [35, 36]. Being unhealthy but still on duty (presenteeism) may reduce work productivity [5].

3. Conceptual Framework

The concept of job stress was based on Lazarus and Folkman’s theory of psychological stress and coping (1984). Using this theory by incorporating the stress process, [37] and [23] identified nine job stressors in nursing: (1) Death and Dying, (2) Conflict with Physicians, (3) Inadequate Emotional Preparation, (4) Problems Relating to Peers, (5) Problems Relating to Supervisors, (6) Work Load, (7) Uncertainty Concerning Treatment, (8) Patients and their Families, and (9) Discrimination. Nurses who perceive low job stress will be active and engage in their work, which will result in better performance [16]. In addition, higher levels of job stress increase sickness presenteeism. The concept of presenteeism, based on [1], is an active employee engagement in work with a focus on cognitive, emotional, and behavioral engagement during work. Presenteeism consists of two components: completing work and avoiding distraction. The relationship between job stress and presenteeism was tested in this study.

4. Methodology

A descriptive correlational research design was used to examine the levels of job stress and presenteeism and identify the relationship between them among nurses in three tertiary care hospitals in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

4.1 Population and sample

The target population of this study was 805 nurses that possessed either a diploma, bachelor’s or master’s degree in nursing in three tertiary care hospitals in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. The Yamane formula (1973) was used to calculate the sample size [38], which were 267. Considering the likelihood of losing some subjects, 20% of the sample size (53) was added into the sample [39]. Therefore, the final sample size was 320 nurses, and 297 questionnaires were returned. Of these, 282 (93%) questionnaires were completed for analysis.
4.2. Research Instruments

The research instrument used in this study was a set of questionnaires which included the following:

1. The Demographic Data Form was designed to collect the study participants’ information including age, gender, marital status, level of nursing education, years of work experience, and basic payment per month.

2. The Stanford Presenteeism Scale (SPS-6) consists of six items with two dimensions. The two dimensions were as follows: 1) completing work and 2) avoiding distraction. Each dimension consists of three items. Each item was placed on a five-point Likert scale from 1 (strongly disagree with the statement) to 5 (strongly agree with the statement) for participants’ responses. Three of the items in the dimension of avoiding distraction were scored reversely.

3. The Extended Nursing Stress Scale (ENSS) consists of 57 items. Responses were rated by using a 5-point Likert scale from 1 (doesn’t apply) to 5 (extremely stressful). The nine dimensions included the following: 1) death and dying, 2) conflict with physicians, 3) inadequate emotional preparation, 4) problems relating to peers, 5) problems relating to supervisors, 6) workload, 7) uncertainty concerning treatment, 8) patients and their families, and 9) discrimination.

4.3 Validity and Reliability of the instrument

With permission from the authors, the researcher used the ENSS and SPS-6 without any modification; therefore, the researcher did not test for validity prior to the study. Twenty nurses from Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre were invited to test the internal consistency reliability of the two instruments. A Cronbach’s alpha of 0.80 was obtained for both the ENSS and SPS-6.

4.4 Data Collection Procedures

Self-administered questionnaires were used to collect data from February to March 2016 at the three tertiary care hospitals in Pakistan. Simple random sampling was used to select the sample from the list of nurses who met the inclusion criteria in each department. After taking consent, the instruments were distributed to the nurses by the research coordinators. Then the research coordinators collected all the returned questionnaires in sealed envelopes and submitted them to the researcher every two weeks. The data were cleaned and checked by the researcher prior to entering into the computer for analysis.

4.5 Data Analysis Procedures

Statistical software was used to analyze the descriptive and inferential statistics in this study. Demographic data, level of JS, and presenteeism were analyzed using descriptive analysis frequency, percentage, mean, and standard deviation. Spearman’s rank-order correlations coefficient was used to examine the relationship between overall job stress and overall presenteeism because the mean scores of both variables were not normally distributed. In relation to the relationship between the two variables, \( r = < 0.3 \) was considered as a weak relationship; \( r = 0.3 \) to \( \leq 0.5 \) was considered a moderate relationship; and \( r = > 0.5 \) was regarded as a strong relationship [40].

5. Ethical considerations

Prior to data collection, the research proposal was approved by the graduate school, Chiang Mai University, and Research Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Nursing, Chiang Mai University, Thailand. In Pakistan, permission was obtained from each tertiary care hospital’s Chief Executive Officers (CEO) and their respective ethics committees. All participants were informed about the purpose and benefits of the study before data collection. They were informed that participation in the study was voluntary, so they could refuse to participate or withdraw anytime. Lastly, the participants who agreed to participate in the study were asked to sign a written consent.

6. Results and Discussion

1. The age of the nurses ranged from 21 to 59 years. The highest age group was 31 – 40 years (43.98%). A majority of the nurses were female (70.92%), and more than half of them (72.35%) were married. More than half of the nurses held a diploma (52.12%), and 52.83% of the nurses had between 1 to 10 years’ work experience. Furthermore, most of the nurses came from the Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre (47.87%). Although the nurses came from six different departments, about 28.36% of the nurses were working at the medical department.

2. The nurses perceived their job stress at a moderate level. All the nine dimensions of JS—work load, uncertainty concerning treatment, patients and their families, death and dying, problems relating to supervisors, problems relating to peers, conflict with physicians, discrimination, and inadequate emotional preparation—were also at moderate level (Table 1).
Inadequate Emotional Discrimination Problems Relating to Supervisors Families Patients and their Treatment Concerning Uncertainty Work Load Overall Job Stress Job Stress

The fact that the Pakistan Nursing Council has wards in Pakistan is approximately 1:50 despite the nurses. The existing nurse-patient ratio in the general particularly, the workload caused by shortages of perceived by nurses in TCHs of Pakistan, which may contribute to the moderate level of JS as study also showed that all dimensions of JS were at a dimensions scores ranged from 24.66 to 7.69. This conducted by [25] in a tertiary care hospital in Hong Kong that used a similar instrument and found a similar result could be explained by the idea that nurses remain actively engaged to support society in Pakistan. According to [45] different sources of social support were found among nurses in Pakistan. Social support is precursor to engagement (presenteeism) among workers [46].

3. Nurses perceived presenteeism for overall and two dimensions at high level (Table 2).

Table 2 Mean, Standard Deviation and the Level of Overall and Each Dimension of Presenteeism as Perceived by the Nurses (n = 282)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presenteeism</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>19.15</td>
<td>3.79</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completing work</td>
<td>9.71</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoiding distraction</td>
<td>9.44</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. There was no statistically significant relationship between overall JS and overall presenteeism (Table 3).

Table 3 Relationship between Overall Level of Job Stress and Overall Presenteeism as Perceived by Study Nurses (n = 282)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Stress</th>
<th>Overall Presenteeism</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall Job Stress</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

1. The perception of job stress (JS): The results of this study show that the overall mean of job stress as perceived by the study nurses was at a moderate level ($\bar{X} = 151.82, SD 24.57$) (Table 1). This finding was consistent with the results of a previous study conducted by [25] in a tertiary care hospital in Hong Kong that used a similar instrument and found a moderate level of JS. In this study, the mean JS dimensions scores ranged from 24.66 to 7.69. This study also showed that all dimensions of JS were at a moderate level (Table 2). There are many reasons which may contribute to the moderate level of JS as perceived by nurses in TCHs of Pakistan, particularly, the workload caused by shortages of nurses. The existing nurse-patient ratio in the general wards in Pakistan is approximately 1:50 despite the fact that the Pakistan Nursing Council has recommended 1:10. As per a government report in the health department, Pakistan lacks 60,000 nurses [28]. In this study, a majority of nurses perceived too many required non-nursing tasks, such as clerical work. This can be explained that these are additional responsibilities which can further increase pressure to fulfill ward/unit tasks. Stress related to their job detracts from the quality of nurses’ working lives, contributes to some forms of physical illness, and may increase minor psychiatric morbidity [41].

2. The perception of presenteeism: The results of this study showed that the overall presenteeism as perceived by the study nurses in the tertiary care hospitals in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan was at high level ($\bar{X} = 19.15, SD 3.79$) (Table 2). The level of this result is consistent with previous studies by [42] in China; and [43] in Croatia. As for the higher scores on presenteeism is vital in that it might worsen current medical illnesses, lessen the quality of working life, and lead to impressions of ineffectiveness at work due to reduced productivity [44]. The results show that most of the nurses were actively engaged in performing their tasks instead of being concerned about their vital individual health problems. This result could be explained by the idea that nurses remain actively engaged to support society in Pakistan. According to [45] different sources of social support were found among nurses in Pakistan. Social support is precursor to engagement (presenteeism) among workers [46].

3. The relationship between JS and Presenteeism: There was no significant relationship between overall JS and overall presenteeism ($r = 0.08, p < 0.15$) (Table 3). The results of this study were consistent with the findings of a joint study in Australia and the UK by [21], which found no significant relationship between presenteeism and job stress. The results of this indicate that although the nurses are facing job stress, they still go to work. Jobs stress was at a moderate level; this means that they can cope with job stress and there is a high likelihood that job stress has no impact on presenteeism. In other words, even if they get sick/stressed, they still go to work. One possible reason can be the possible rules and regulations for seeking leave—either nurses are sick or have urgent matters such as attending the funeral of close relative. Nurses in Pakistan can avail twenty-five days of casual leave (on emergency grounds) which is paid. In addition, they can apply for sick leave depending upon the severity of the illness and a medical doctor’s opinion to take rest during such an illness. Hence, in the case that a nurse
feels sickness and they still come to work, their productivity may decrease.

7. Conclusion and Future Work
In this research, authors have explored the level of job stress (moderate) and presenteeism (high) as perceived by nurses in tertiary level hospitals in Pakistan. The results of this study will provide considerations for both nurses and hospital administrators in order to maintain presenteeism. In addition, strategies need to be developed to recruit more nurses and ancillary/support staff, such as nurse aids in order to reduce non-nursing task work performances by nurses confronting to the stresses of the work setting. Nursing superintendents should foster a conducive work environment for nurses with their working hours and should improve approaches to decrease work load by reducing non-nursing tasks. Future research can be valuable to explore job stress for nurses in different levels of hospitals which have different environments and supporting systems. In addition, no significant relationship was found between job stress and presenteeism; thus, the relationship between other variables that may relate to presenteeism need to be explored.

8. References